

NWIFCA Authority Meeting

18th September 2020; 11.00 a.m.

**AGENDA
ITEM NO.
12**

NWIFCA Review of Policies, Procedures and Governance

Purpose of Report: To report tender outcome

Recommendation: Endorse tender outcome and appoint the firm RPA to undertake the review

Background

1. In 2018, NWIFCA agreed to undertake a review of policies procedures and governance of NWIFCA with a budget of £15,000. A Review committee of members was appointed consisting of Mr Graham, Cllr Markley, Mr Jones, Mr Leigh and Dr Andrews.
2. A specification was developed by the RFO in 2019. Advice on tendering procedure and a template format were provided by Lancashire County Council procurement department.
3. Members were consulted on the Specification, Invitation to Tender, Assessment Criteria and the 5 firms invited to tender.
4. NWIFCA Constitution requires tenders to be requested by post and opened by the Responsible Finance Officer in the presence of a member of the Authority. However, to take account of guidelines to mitigate the effects of covid 19, tenders were invited by email to be sent to the RFO and on receipt sent to all members of the Review Committee.
5. ITT documents were sent to the agreed firms in January 2020.

Tender Outcome

6. Two valid tenders were received by email as requested within the deadline and sent on to the review committee before assessment from:
 - a. North West Employers (NWE)
 - b. Risk Policy Analysts (RPA)
7. Tenders were scored by the RFO according to the criteria and weighting as set out in the ITT and shown in the table at Annex A. The scores were sent to the review committee.
8. RPA scored 38 as against NWE score of 22 and therefore scored highest by a wide margin on the criteria set out in the agreed Invitation to Tender. RPA are assessed as the clear winner in marine and IFCA knowledge and experience and value for money in terms of hours offered to undertake the review. See Annex A and B for details.
9. Lancashire County Council procurement department have advised that under local government procedures the contract should be offered to the highest scoring tender. The contract cannot be offered to a firm offering less value for money although the Authority may choose not to carry out the review at this time and discard the tenders.
10. The NWIFCA constitution requires the Finance and HR Committee to approve the appointment of contractors. The Committee were sent this tender appraisal on 26 August. Their response will be reported at the meeting on 18 September.

Conclusion of the Tender Process

11. It is recommended by the RFO that RPA should be appointed to undertake the NWIFCA review of Policies, Procedures and Governance

ANNEX A: SCORING OF TENDERS AS PER INVITATION TO TENDER

Criteria	Weight	RPA	NWE
Work Plan	10%	Detailed Score 4	Outline Score 2
Focus groups: Number & membership	10%	2 groups Detailed membership & purpose defined Score 4	Number, membership and purpose not specified. Score 2
Number and list documents to be reviewed	10%	Detailed list of documents to be reviewed Score 4	Documents to be reviewed not specified. Score 2
Number interviews and people interviewed	10%	10 interviews across specified sectors. Score 4	Number and people not specified. Score 2
Structure of the report	10%	6 parts with content detail. Score 4	6 parts no content detail ' Score 2
Numbers of days and hours quoted	10%	32.25 days. Score 4	17 days Score 2
Relevant experience	20%	List of marine related projects delivered. Score $4*2=8$	No marine experience Score $1*2=2$
Total Price	20%	Score $5*2=10$	Score $4*2=8$
Total score		38	22

FURTHER Assessment of the tenders by the RFO

North West Employers (NWE):

- a. 12 pages of text
- b. Lacks detail of how the project would be delivered
- c. No prior knowledge or experience of IFCA is quoted
- d. No experience of projects related to the marine environment or fisheries are quoted
- e. Project description contains no detail on how interviews and focus groups would be run
- f. No list or detail on the data sources or corporate documents which would be reviewed
- g. No relevant experience of an organisational policies, procedures and governance review is presented
- h. Text difficult to read with undefined terms such as 'Organisational diagnostic', 'orientation into the organisation' and 'triangulation of data'.
- i. Time for analysis, reporting and presentation of 4 days.
- j. CVs of team members outline only
- k. **Price quoted is £15,000 for 17 Days work**

Risk Policy Analysts (RPA):

- a. 24 pages of text
- b. The work plan for delivery of the review is detailed and specific. It includes an Inception meeting and desk based data analysis as well as focus groups, questionnaires and interviews.
- c. RPA have detailed knowledge of IFCA Page 1 'Strengths of IFCA' references and examples are quoted. The IFCA Vision, High level Objectives, Success criteria and indicators are quoted and assessed.
- d. RPA have extensive experience of listed relevant marine and environment related projects.
- e. Field work is described in detail including defined numbers of semi structured interviews, Web based surveys Focus groups. Defined time is allocated to review, reporting and data analysis.
- f. A list is provided of specific NWIFCA source documents to be reviewed with national policy documents and academic literature.
- g. Includes evidence of research into IFCA including the evaluation of IFCA funded by Defra which reported in 2020. This report is awaiting publication. It has been shown to IFCA Chief Officers.
- h. Tender is clearly expressed and well organised.
- i. Reporting will include an 8 page interim report, a draft report, and a presentation
- j. Detailed CVs of team members and experience
- k. **Price quoted is £14950 for 32.25 Days work**

CEO NWIFCA 27 August 2020